

“Community women and youth leaders’ awareness and actions undertaken by them to realize rights and access to services”

A rapid assessment in three low-income communities of Delhi where Jagori works – Bawana Resettlement Colony, Madanpur Khadar Resettlement Colony and (Tajpur Pahadi and Bilaspur Camp) Badarpur

Key findings and Suggestions

Acknowledgements

- Team who administered the questionnaires: Kailash, Juhi, Ruhi, Sunita, Heeravati, Ritu, Naurati, Laxmi, Seema and Praveena, Jagori
- Facilitators for the FGDs and KIIs: Madhu in Bawana and Chaitali in Madanpur Khadar and Badarpur, note-takers for the FGDs and KIIs: Prachi, Richa and Praveena
- Data entry, coding and first level analysis: Gagan Parida, a consultant
- Report compilation: Shruti and Praveena
- Planning, design and review inputs: Surabhi Tandon Mehrotra, Suneeta Dhar, Madhu and Geetha Nambisan, Jagori and Dr. Rajib Nandy, ISST for his inputs for the sample selection process

Brief background

Existing literature (research studies undertaken by Jagori as well as other organizations, student research papers, newspaper articles etc.) has shown that women in the low-income communities suffer most due to gaps in service provision - impact on their household work, personal well being and end up paying a heavy price towards access to services including food, water, sanitation, health, livelihood and education opportunities. Inadequate and at times even complete lack of service provision has serious impact on the safety of women and girls. Various NGOs and collectives have been working in these areas to draw the attention of the government to the continued negligence and deficit in services. A range of efforts have been made to seek the government accountability on this front, but still the major challenge is the fragmented government structure where there is no clear division of roles and responsibilities among various service providers. It results in not only a lack of acknowledgement of the issues but also the lack of acceptance by the concerned departments that have an accountability to address these issues.

Over years, Jagori's major contribution has been in developing women and youth leadership and building their understanding on their rights and access to services. There have been constant efforts to link them to various forums and alliances so that they can raise their voices and demand the accountability from service providers. However, there is a dearth of data which examines the understanding of women and youth leaders regarding different dimensions of service provision. Exploring this understanding is critical to a rights based approach whereby the community leaders are themselves equipped to identify, strategize and address their service concerns at both the local and higher administrative levels.

Key Objectives

From the insights shared by the community group members, the assessment aims to:

- Conduct a situational analysis and understand gaps in their access to identity cards, access to services and access to social security schemes,
- Understand their process of undertaking actions in addressing these issues
- Collate their suggestions to identify the way forward for their community groups, and their expectation from Jagori and other local organizations over the next two years

Area (s)/Site (s)

The assessment was conducted in the three low-income communities of Delhi where Jagori has been working from a rights based perspective – Bawana, Madanpur Khadar and Badarpur. The work in Bawana and Madanpur Khadar was started in the year 2004-05 where as the work in Badarpur was started in the year 2012.

Bawana has been the onsite of relocation since 2002. The area has been organized into 12 blocks, the newer 7 blocks being built recently in 2009. Residents living there were relocated from Yamuna Pushta, Dhapa Colony, Banuwal Nagar, Saraswati Vihar, Deepali Chowk, Vikaspuri, Nagla Machi, Jahangirpuri, etc. The colony is located towards the Haryana border and remains outside the urban boundaries of the latest Master Plan of 2021. Located 23 Km in North-West of Delhi, Bawana comes in the urban extension Zone ‘N’ of Delhi, the closest metro station is Rithala being 14 km away. It has a population of almost 1.5 lakh residents. Majorly residents are Muslims. The plot size is 12.5 and 18 square meter. Majority of its population are migrants from Uttar Pradesh, Bihar, Madhya Pradesh and West Bengal. Some of them have also migrated from Chhattisgarh, Rajasthan, Uttarakhand, Haryana and Nepal. The residents mostly work as daily wage workers; head loaders, rickshaw pullers, domestic workers, factory workers, hand cart pullers and rag pickers. Some of them also work as drivers of Rural Transport Vehicles (RTV) or E-rickshaws, and as mechanics. A large chunk of women work in factories and engage in piece rate work. They also run dhabas, grocery stores and paan-bidi stalls.

Madanpur Khadar has been the onsite of relocation since early 2000. The area has been organized into 7 blocks. Residents living there were relocated from Raj Nagar, DP Singh Camp, Nizamuddin, Ashram, Alaknanda etc. It is located on the South-western fringe of Delhi, with a population of approx. 150,000 people. Majority of residents are Hindu. The plot size is 12, 18 and 22 square meter. The closest metro station is Sarita Vihar. The major work of residents include low-wage jobs comprising of peons, drivers, domestic workers, construction workers, security guards, sweepers, rag pickers, hawkers and vendors, industrial and commercial workers. Women specifically work as domestic workers, factory workers, taxi drivers, street hawkers and NGO workers.

Badarpur is located in the South District, close to the edge with Haryana State. There are 35 colonies under Badarpur (acc. to MCD). Mostly residents are Hindu. There is diversity in the economic status of people. Some pockets are owned predominantly by affluent land owners, largely around the Badarpur market. Others are in private jobs while some are self employed. Private jobs are largely taken by migrants from Bihar, north eastern states and Nepal, while men from Delhi, UP, West Bengal and Haryana are largely self employed in small business like dhabas, street vendors or mobile shops in Nehru Place and Okhla. A very minor population also works outside Delhi with their families staying in the city. As for women, they are mostly homemakers. Some women work as balwadi (pre-school) teachers, anganwadi (health care) helpers, run small tea/food stalls and shops.

Methodology

Methods used – A questionnaire was administered and Focused Group Discussions (FGDs) and Key Informant Interviews (KIIs) were conducted.

Sample selection process – for the questionnaire

The current rapid assessment is a 'small area study'. In small area studies, many variables cannot be taken in the sample selection process as the small number would make it statistically nonviable. Therefore, sample was selected randomly from the groups of women and youth formed by Jagori in the three communities, using the random number tables. More than 40% of the group members from each community were selected as samples; a small extra number in the sample was taken out to check if some randomly selected member was not available to respond to the questionnaire, at the time of administering it.

FGDs: 10 participants were selected from the women's groups and youth groups in each community.

KIIs: The key informants were approached and those who gave time were selected

The questionnaire was administered to members of 11 groups – 5 in Bawana, 4 in Madanpur Khadar and 2 in Badarpur. These groups comprised of 300 members out of whom 191 respondents were selected for the current assessment; 80 from Bawana, 36 from Badarpur and 75 from Madanpur Khadar. The respondents comprised of 118 women, 37 girls and 35 boys. They belonged to groups formed by Jagori at different points of time during the course of its work and the different groups may have a varied awareness depending on the time period of intervention. Their year of association was in the range of more than 1 year up to 12 years.

FGDs : 6 FGDs were conducted – one with the women's groups and one with the youth groups in Bawana and 1 with the women's groups and one with the youth groups in Madanpur Khadar and 2 with women's groups in Badarpur. The participants were selected from the same set of 300 members from the community groups formed by Jagori; however these were not the same who participated in administering of the questionnaire. A semi-structured guide was developed to understand the perceptions of the community group members on the gaps in services, their relationship with stakeholders and gather their suggestions to address these gaps.

KIIs were conducted with Asha workers, Anganwadi workers, safai karamcharis, ration shopkeepers and police officials. A semi-structured guide was developed to understand the perspective of local service providers in the context of service provision and gather their recommendations.

Ethical considerations

Written consent was undertaken after sharing details of the assessment, its purpose, the expected duration of the respondents' participation, how will it benefit to the respondents and any possible risks/discomfort associated with the assessment. Also that their participation was voluntary and that refusal to participate would incur any penalty/denial of benefits. It was also shared that the privacy/confidentiality of their identity will be maintained.

Time line

- Meetings with the consultants and research team – for developing protocol, rapid assessment questionnaire, FGDs and KIIs guides: April-June, 2016
- Selection of the team for administering the questionnaires, related trainings and workshops, reflection exercises: May-June, 2016
- Administering of the questionnaires: May-June, 2016
- FGDs and KIIs: June-July, 2016
- Data entry, coding and analysis: June-July, 2016
- Report compilation and finalization: July-Sep, 2016

Key findings

From the administering of the questionnaire and FGDs

Brief profile of the respondents

Age Group	Overall	Bawana	Badarpur	Madanpur Khadar
Sample Base	191	80	36	75
14-18 years	16%	19%	0%	20%
19-23 years	23%	28%	0%	29%
24-28 years	12%	11%	19%	8%
29-33 years	7%	5%	14%	5%
34-40 years	17%	18%	25%	13%
Above 40 years	26%	20%	42%	24%

Religion	Overall	Bawana	Badarpur	Madanpur Khadar
Sample Base	191	80	36	75
Hindu	81%	70%	89%	89%
Muslim	17%	30%	11%	7%
Christian	1%	0%	0%	3%
Buddhist	1%	0%	0%	1%

Caste	Overall	Bawana	Badarpur	Madanpur Khadar
Sample Base	191	80	36	75
Scheduled caste	35%	19%	39%	51%
Scheduled tribe	2%	0%	6%	3%
Other backward classes	18%	13%	11%	27%
General	45%	69%	44%	20%

Marital status	Overall	Bawana	Badarpur	Madanpur Khadar
Sample Base	191	80	36	75
Married	47%	48%	78%	31%
Unmarried(never married)	39%	43%	0%	55%
Divorced	1%	0%	3%	0%
Separated(but not divorced)	2%	3%	6%	0%
Widow	12%	8%	14%	15%

- The respondents were, by design, primarily women and girls (80% from the entire sample) and boys which comprised 20% male respondents of the sample. Bawana: 24% male, 76% female, Badarpur: 100% female and Madanpur Khadar: 25% male, 75% female.
- In Bawana, majority of the respondents were in the age-group of 19-23 years, in Badarpur, majority were in the age-group of 34-40 years and in Madanpur Khadar, majority were in the age-group of 19-23 years.
- In terms of religion, majority were Hindus (81%), followed by Muslims (17%) and only a few were Christians and Buddhists (1% each in Madanpur Khadar only).
- In terms of caste composition, majority of the respondents belonged to General Caste (45%), followed by SCs (35%), OBCs (18%) and STs (2%). SCs have the highest percentage in Madanpur Khadar (51%) and lowest percentage in Bawana (19%), STs were

only in Badarpur (6%) and Madanpur Khadar (3%). The OBCs had the highest percentage in Khadar (27%) and the lowest percentage in Badarpur (11%). Further, the general category had the highest percentage in Bawana (69%) and the lowest percentage in Madanpur Khadar (20%).

- There were a highest percentage of the married respondents (47%) – which were all women, followed by unmarried (39%), widows (12%), separated (2%) and divorced (1%). In Bawana, the highest percentage was of the married (48%), followed by unmarried (43%), 3% Separated but not divorced and 8% widows and In Badarpur, the highest percentage was of the married (78%), 3% divorced, 6% separated but not divorced and 14% widows. Further in Khadar, the highest percentage was of married (31%), unmarried (55%) and 15% widows. All the boys and girls from the groups in Bawana and Khadar were unmarried.

Education

Educational qualifications	Overall	Bawana	Badarpur	Madanpur Khadar
Sample Base	191	80	36	75
Never went to school	31%	35%	31%	27%
Up to class v	23%	20%	44%	16%
Up to class x	15%	9%	17%	20%
Up to class xii	25%	33%	8%	25%
Graduate (passed B.A.)	5%	3%	0%	11%
Basic literacy (signature, counting) learnt through NGOs	1%	1%	0%	0%
Pursuing B.A	1%	0%	0%	1%

The data revealed that the greatest % age of respondents was from the category who never attended school (31%). The highest level of literacy was found in Madanpur Khadar where the % age of graduates was 11%.

Work

Only 37% of the respondents were employed (above 18 years). They worked in the occupations of domestic work, factory work, daily wage labor, Asha work, Anganwadi work, driving, sales jobs, street vendors, computer data entry operation, NGO work and others. In Bawana, majority of the women respondents worked as factory workers, whereas in Madanpur Khadar, majority of women

worked as domestic workers. In Badarpur, majority of respondents were homemakers and those who were employed worked as street vendors. Out of employed youth, the number of employed young boys' respondents is greater than young girls' respondents. The young girls worked as cab drivers, NGO workers, factory workers and domestic workers and young boys worked as computer data entry operators, shopkeepers, sales persons, NGO workers and cab drivers.

The young boys and girls' respondents were engaged in skilled and semi skilled forms of work whereas women were engaged in unskilled work. This variation was also reflected in their monthly income. The employed women and young girls' respondents had a monthly income within the bracket of Rs. 1000 to Rs. 10,000; whereas the monthly income of young boys' respondents was between Rs. 5000 to more than Rs. 15,000.

The respondents were asked their awareness on vocational courses held in the communities. Majority of them were aware of such courses. They stated that these courses were provided by the local NGOs – CASP Plan in Madanpur Khadar, Navjyoti Foundation in Bawana and GRCs – Prayas in Bawana. The courses involved classes for basic computer, tailoring, tally, English speaking course, personality development, and beauty parlor, tailoring and driving.

The respondents were also asked about their awareness on the provision of crèches facilities at their workplaces and whether they used these facilities. Only 11% of the respondents were aware of crèche facilities and they stated there was no such provision at their workplaces; however some local NGOs provided these facilities namely, WAUS and Mobile Crèches in Madanpur Khadar and Savera youth group in Bawana. Only 2% of the respondents used these facilities.

It was noted that this trend of pursuing BSW and working as NGO workers was a recent trend. They primarily worked as field animators and community mobilizers and fellows in the local NGOs including Jagori in all three communities, Madanpur Khadar: Agragami, Etasha, Azad Foundation, Bawana: Child Survival India, Magic Bus, Viklang Sahara Samiti and Megha Plant Trust in Badarpur.

Type of household

73% of the respondents stay in a nuclear and 27% stay in a joint household. Highest percentage of respondents stay in nuclear households in Bawana: 89%, 11%, Khadar: 59%, 41% and Badarpur: 67%, 33%

Implications

- Since the sample was selected from the community groups formed by Jagori, these findings reveal the nature of the groups that we are working with. It could be reflected whether there is scope to influence the nature of the group in terms of a greater representation of most marginalized groups of women: non-plot holders, drop-out youth, people with disabilities and single women in the groups formed by Jagori.

- In the case of single women, an effort is underway to form a group of single women in Madanpur Khadar; the possibilities of forming such groups in other two communities can also be explored.
- Given low literacy, information campaigns to rely less on written media and more on audio visual.
- Implications of nuclear households vs. extended family households for caring responsibilities need for child care, to be explored.

Situation analysis and gaps

Access to identity cards

“An array of identity cards is an essential tool for anyone living in India, necessary for daily processes from getting a gas connection or mobile phone to accessing government benefits. Cards are needed to satisfy both proof of identity and proof of address requirements. In settlements with uncertain tenure, such as JJs, it is this latter proof that is most difficult and important to obtain, a challenge that directly impedes access to basic services” – Planning the slum, CPR

The current assessment revealed the percentage of respondents who accessed and didn't access the important proofs of residence – Ration Cards, Voter ID Cards and Aadhar cards. Further, the data discussed the major challenges the respondents faced in the application process.

Overall, majority of the respondents accessed these cards, though it varied between the three communities and between the three groups – women, girls and boys. Out of all the 3 cards, majority had the Aadhar cards (99%), followed by ration cards (86%) and voter ID cards (85%). Bawana took the lead in access to ration cards (91%); Khadar took the lead in access to voter ID cards (85%).

Majority of the respondents cited that the most important challenge they faced was that they had to make frequent visits to the concerned departments to know about the status of their application due to technical constraints. And this was because they are illiterate; they are easily fooled by the service providers. Other challenges included – not having supporting documents and lack of awareness on the application process.

Only a few respondents had access to driving license and passport – especially boys. Though there were some women and girls who learnt driving from Azad Foundation (a Delhi based NGO) and are working as drivers, some have passport as well, yet some women and girls made some interesting remarks on the questions related to accessing a driving license and passport were asked.

“How would I drive? I am a woman”

“I never thought about having a driving license before but now I will apply, I also want to drive, I am planning to buy a scooty”

“Why do I need a passport? I stay here; in the colony. Where would I go?”

“I don't have one. But my husband has a passport and that's enough!”

“It's enough if I get out from the four walls of my house, I have never even thought about going outside my country then why would I need a passport?”

Implications

- A general misperception need to be addressed that a passport is only required for travelling outside the country and that it is not an identity proof in itself.
- It is not true that the people in lower income communities don't aspire to travel outside the country and this needs to be challenged.
- Notions that women can't and don't need to drive needs to be challenged.

Access to services

The community work over the years revealed that the major challenges that the residents in lower income communities had to face were material struggles and were centred on the access to essential services. The current assessment revealed major challenges cited by the respondents, which related to an inadequate, poorly maintained and gender insensitive design of physical infrastructure, negligence on part of the service providers, short staffed local government departments and the gender insensitive attitude of the service providers

- **Public Distribution System/Ration:** Long queue at the fair price shop was the major challenge (cited by 66% of the respondents), followed by other challenges including – shop remains closed, less than entitled amount is provided, gender insensitive attitude of the fair price shopkeeper.
- **Health:** Discrimination in the government hospitals was the major challenge (cited by 66% of the respondents), followed by other challenges including insensitive attitude of the doctors, distant location of government dispensaries and hospitals, limited public transport connecting the 3 communities to the government dispensaries and hospitals and lack of awareness on health schemes
- **Water:** Poor quality of water supply was the major challenge (cited by 67% of the respondents), followed by other challenges including – untimely water supply, inadequate water supply due to frequent power cuts and long queues for water collection – resultant quarrel with neighbours.
- **Sanitation:** Poor condition of community toilet complexes (CTCs) was the major challenge (cited by 79% of respondents), followed by other challenges including – inadequate CTCs, poor maintenance of CTCs, inadequate staff for cleaning and maintenance of CTCs, gender insensitive design of infrastructure, closure of CTCs during certain hours of day and not opened 24X 7, inadequate water supply inside the CTCs and feeling unsafe due to presence of men's and boys' groups and people under substance abuse in the CTC premises and outside it.
- **Education:** Higher number of students in school was the major challenge (cited by 58% of the respondents) followed by other challenges including – lack of quality education at school, poor sanitation services inside schools, poor quality of potable water, inadequate and inefficient teachers, insensitive attitude of teachers, presence of boys' groups outside school premises and selling of alcohol inside the school and resultant fights amongst students.

- **Work:** Poor state of sanitation services (inadequate toilets, lack of separate toilets on the basis of gender and denied usage of toilets) was the major challenge (cited by 63% of the respondents) followed by other challenges including – male workers’ and employers’ insensitive attitude.
- **Violence Prevention and Redressal:** Poor response time of Police on helpline number 100 (PCR), was the major challenge (cited by 71% of the respondents) followed by other challenges including – insensitive attitude of the police officials, their denial in filing FIR, inadequate women officials at the women’s help desk at the local police station and police’s denial to write complaints and rather asking the victims to bring written complaints. Another challenge was problems faced while registering a MLC at the hospital.

One category (although a very small percentage but an important one for analysis) emerged as not facing any challenges at all. This pointed towards normalization of the challenges and acceptance of the situation believing that nothing can be done about it or working their way around the limited access to the services due to their everyday needs.

FGDs revealed that service providers focus only women’s reproductive health in these communities and in the paradigm of reproductive health too, major emphasis is given on pre and post natal care and not on menstrual health, issues of anemia of women and girls. In the FGDs, several questions were posed to gauge the participants’ perceptions and stereotypical attitudes related to certain issues.

On some issues, the participants reinforced certain stereotypes. Most of the participants stated that girls should consult gynecologists before marriage if they have any menstrual issues – delay in their cycle. Interestingly, barring a few participants, who considered that such consultations are important for girls’ health; most of the participants cited their importance because menstrual issues might impact reproduction which is crucial for their marriage. Some of the participants believed that such consultations should be kept secretive; only the daughter and mother should be aware of these. This reflected that social taboos related to menstrual health still persist in these communities. In the context of violence against women, some of the participants’ responses revealed a hint of cause and effect relationship between alcohol consumption and domestic violence.

On other issues, the participants challenged the societal stereotypes. The reasons stated for women to go outside and work were not limited to every-day survival but also for financial independence and for fulfilling their personal aspirations of watching movies, buying latest clothes and make-up. The responses also broke the myths that women should go outside and work only when there is low earning at home or if the man does not work.

Implications

- The health component needs to be addressed more critically; the capacity building sessions need to specifically discuss issues of menstrual health, cervical cancer, breast cancer, mental health and indigenous health practices.

Access to social security schemes (pensions, scholarships, insurance etc.)

93% of the respondents had individual bank accounts and 7% had joint bank accounts. 63% stated that they opened the accounts specifically for availing specific government schemes. The respondents were given a list of social security schemes out of which they had to state which ones they availed. The list included – Ladli Yojana, Labour scholarship scheme, Medhaavi Chatra Yojana, Rasoil gas subsidy, Old Age Assistance/Senior Citizen Scheme/Widow/ Government Pension scheme, Pradhan Mantri Jeevan Jyoti Bima Yojana, Jan-Dhan Yojana, Suraksha Bima Yojana (LIC), Minority student scholarship scheme and Disability Pension scheme.

The data revealed that the most availed scheme was the Rasoil gas subsidy (56 % of the respondents), the least availed scheme was the disability pension scheme (1% of the respondents) and 8% respondents did not avail any scheme out of the above mentioned list. The trend was similar when the data was analyzed community wise.

FGDs revealed that factors such as lack of supporting documentation, lack of knowledge, or lack of response from the authorities were the reasons behind the respondents' limited access to the schemes.

Implications

- Awareness programmes and advertising by the government impact people's ability to avail schemes. Schemes such as Ladli Yojana and Rasoil Gas subsidy gained a lot of advertising in comparison to schemes such as disability pension schemes and Minority student scholarship scheme. Thus, there is a need to invest in such programmes by the government.

Actions undertaken

Interventions with the Stakeholders

The stakeholders listed in the questionnaire were those stakeholders with whom the respondents developed a relationship as a part of their advocacy interventions. The stakeholders included: Local governance officials – MLAs, Councilors and Local Pradhans

Service providers – SHOs, Police officers at the women's help desk, police beat officers, police beat constables, lawyers, School Principals and Vice-Principals, College lecturers, ration shopkeepers, Food and Supply officers, Community Toilet Complexes (CTC) caretakers, Safai Karamcharis, Junior Engineer (JE), Anganwadi workers, Asha workers, employers, Gender Resource centers' officials.

The respondents were asked following questions:

- In the time span up to last three years, how many respondents approached these stakeholders to raise their issues of concern?
- How many of them were satisfied with the stakeholders' response?

Local governance officials

Majority of the respondents (55%) approached MLAs to raise their issues of concern and were satisfied with the response. In the case of Councilors, only 20% respondents approached them and those who approached, were satisfied with the response. Only 20% of the respondents approached Local Pradhans and were dissatisfied with the response.

Service providers

Majority of the respondents approached Ration Shopkeeper, Food and Supply Officer, Safai Karamcharis, CTC and pumphouse caretakers and the response was satisfactory. However, most of them did not approach Junior Engineer (JE), Principal/Vice-Principal, Lecturer, Anganwadi workers, Asha workers, Police officers at the women's help desk, Police beat officers and constables, SHO, lawyers and Gender Resource Centres (GRCs). In terms of policing, Police beat officers and constables were the categories which were approached by the respondents, in comparison to the police officers at the women's help desk and SHO. However, the response was more satisfactory in the case of the latter.

FGDs pointed out that the efforts of the group members over several years brought out positive changes in the relationship with the stakeholders. However, it varied between different stakeholders. The FGD participants stated that their relationship with the ration shopkeepers and food and supply officer substantially improved and yielded desirable results. They stated that they faced major challenges in approaching the police officials due to their poor response and gender insensitive attitude. In the case of Asha workers and Anganwadi workers, the participants stated that they shared a comfortable relationship with them since most of the group members themselves held those positions. However, the major gap was the Asha workers' and Anganwadi workers' limited awareness regarding their roles and responsibilities and mechanisms to resolve the community members' concerns. For instance, the Asha workers who had a primary responsibility in the context of the Mohalla Clinics, themselves had a limited understanding of their roles and responsibilities. Further, FGDs highlighted a major distrust on the local Pradhans due to their corrupt and biased practices.

Awareness of and Representation in the community level vigilance committees

The respondents were asked to share their awareness of, their representation in the community level vigilance committees and their participation in the meetings organized by these committees in the time span of last three years

- School Management Committees (SMCs): Majority of the respondents was aware that SMCs are constituted, a very few respondents (6%) were members of SMCs (the

respondents from women's groups were themselves and the parents of the respondents from boys' and girls' groups). Out of the three communities, a fairly high number of respondents from Madanpur Khadar were members of SMCs and very few from Badarpur and Bawana.

- Resident Welfare Associations (RWAs): Though majority of the respondents were aware that RWAs are constituted, none of the respondents were the members.
- Thana Level Committees (TLCs): Majority of the respondents was unaware of the constitution of the TLCs. TLCs did not have representation of community members but the community members associated with NGOs participated in the same. Majority of the respondents was unaware of the meetings held by the TLCs; out of the three communities, Badarpur was the least aware. From those who were aware, majority of the respondents stated that the meetings were irregular and the time period also varied in all the three communities. A very few of the respondents participated in these meetings from Bawana and Madanpur Khadar, in the last three years; majority of the respondents who participated were from Bawana followed by Madanpur Khadar; no respondent from Badarpur participated in the TLC meetings.

FGDs revealed that in all these committees, the participants had a limited awareness of the structure of these committees and their decision making power. In the context of SMCs, the participants stated that there is an irregularity of meetings; and the meetings were often concentrated on the issues of school infrastructure and not on the quality of education and the inefficiency of teachers. One of the participants pointed out, *"We often want to discuss about the issues of girls' safety but the school administration turns a deaf ear and rather states that SMCs are not a right forum to discuss such issues"*. One of the respondents from Bawana, stated how once some of them were selected as members of RWAs but were soon disassociated. The women's poor representation in such committees reflects the patriarchal social norms that disregard women's decision making abilities and agency.

Implications

Though the sample of the current assessment was a handful of respondents from the three communities; however had an ample scope of reflecting on the implications for planning the way ahead and a collaborative role of the government and NGOs

- The government should invest in initiating awareness raising programmes for service providers for clearly understanding their roles and responsibilities and public forums/meetings where the community members could interact with the service providers and raise their concerns. The government should also initiate gender sensitization drives for the stakeholders. Both these initiatives could be undertaken in partnership with local NGOs.
- The government should ensure a greater awareness of and representation of community members along with the service providers, in the community level vigilance committees to

ensure transparency and accountability. Such committees have a tremendous potential to ensure quality of service provision and transform the existing governance system, characterized by limited accountability and a patriarchal outlook of the system functionaries and stakeholders. Through the positive actions led by the community members, especially women, there is a scope to initiate a constructive dialogue with other stakeholders and to work towards reinstating a well functioning system of service provision first at the local levels and then at the larger systemic levels.

Awareness campaigns

The respondents were asked to share about their awareness of campaigns on the selected issues and their participation in these campaigns; led by government and local NGOs

- Campaigns related to water and sanitation – the respondents mentioned the names of activities held at the community level as a part of the national level campaign – “Swachh Bharat Abhiyan” and certain information dissemination campaigns initiated by local NGOs including Jagori; 49% participated
- Campaigns related to education – the respondents mentioned the names of activities held at the community level, specifically in schools as a part of the national level campaigns – Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan and Beti Bachao, Beti Padhao and certain information dissemination campaigns initiated by local NGOs – Madanpur Khadar: CASP Plan, Plan India, Efraha, Etasha; Bawana: Child Survival India, Navjyoti Foundation and Badarpur: Megha Plant Trust and Tara Centre; 24% participated
- Campaigns related to health – the respondents did not talk about any campaigns; they mentioned the names of activities including free vaccination camps for pregnant women and children, initiated by Asha workers, Anganwadi workers and general health-check up by GRCs and local NGOs – Badarpur: Tara centre; 25% participated
- Campaigns related to work – the respondents were not aware of any such campaigns in their communities
- Campaigns related to violence prevention and redressal – the respondents primarily mentioned the names of Jagori led campaigns; 84% participated

Overall, the highest percentage of the respondents were aware of and participated in the campaigns related to violence prevention and redressal (84%) and the lowest percentage of the respondents were aware of and participated in the campaigns (24%) related to education. The respondents participated as well as mobilized others to participate in the above mentioned campaigns

Help lines

The respondents were asked to share their awareness, usage (by themselves and their support to others) in the last 3 years and service providers’ response of the help lines.

Help lines related to ration: they mentioned about the number 1967; 20% of the respondents used it

Help lines related to health: they mentioned about the ambulance help line number 102; 11% of the respondents used it

Help lines related to education: they were not aware of any such helpline

Help lines related to work: they were not aware of any such helpline

Help lines related to violence prevention and redressal: A fairly high number of respondents were aware of the help lines related to violence against women; they mentioned about the police helpline number 100 and women's helpline number 181; 47% age of the respondents used these; majority used the 100 more in comparison to 181.

In terms of response, on help lines related to ration, there was a mixed response, on the ambulance helpline number and majority of those who used was satisfied. On violence, overall analysis revealed that majority of respondents was unsatisfied. However, this response varied between the police helpline number 100 and women's helpline number 181. Though police helpline number 100 was used by most of the respondents in comparison to women's helpline number 181, however, the response of the latter was more satisfactory.

FGDs revealed the challenges faced in using these help lines. The participants' responses were related to the insensitive attitude of the people, who attended these calls, lack of clarity in their response; some of them also shared that they were unaware on what kind of issues could they discuss over help lines.

The respondents were also asked on their awareness and usage of Jagori's Helpline number. Though 96% of the respondents were aware of this number; only 14% used it. The response was satisfactory. They also stated that since there were centres in all the three communities; major interaction is face-to-face and help line is only used to discuss progress updates on their cases.

Implications

- There is a need to build awareness on all the help lines, public awareness raising initiatives should be initiated by the government departments.

Use of RTIs

Only 26% of the respondents used RTIs to state their queries, addressed to the government departments. Over the last three years, a fairly high percentage of the respondents used RTIs in Bawana (35%) and Badarpur (33%) in comparison to Madanpur Khadar (12%). Overall 51% respondents used the RTIs to state the queries for the community concerns and 49% respondents used these to state their personal queries. Overall 90% of respondents filed their RTIs with support from Jagori, 8% through other local NGOs (Action Aid, Pardarshita and Savera Youth group in Bawana) and 2% respondents filed RTIs independently. The percentage of respondents, who were completely dependent on Jagori for filing RTIs, was the highest in Badarpur, followed by Madanpur Khadar and Bawana.

Overall 41% of the respondents received the information expected, 31% did not receive any information but their work began on the concerned issues, 25% collected information and went ahead with the issue and only 4% went up to the appeal procedure (1st appeal)

Overall 65% were satisfied with the response. In terms of issues on which these RTIs were filed; Overall 45% of the respondents filed RTIs on issues related to ration, 25% on issues related to water and sanitation, 20% on violence prevention and redressal and remaining 10% on issues of education, health, work, government schemes (Ladli Yojana and pension). Majority of the respondents who filed RTIs were women in all the three communities.

Conducting Safety Audits

Only 40% of the respondents conducted safety audits; 36% of them conducted the audits using the mobile app Safetipin. 93% of the respondents conducted these audits as a part of Jagori while others on the behalf of other local NGOs, mostly trained by Jagori. Majority of women used this tool in Badarpur followed by Bawana and Madanpur Khadar. Youth from all three communities used this tool. 45% of the respondents participated as observers, 33% as note takers, 18% as interviewers and 4% in other responsibilities. 72% of the respondents stated that the recommendations from the safety audits were submitted to local government stakeholders. 84% of the respondents stated that due to conducting safety audits and submitting recommendations, services have improved in their communities, 12% stated that services have worsened even after submitting recommendations, 3% shared there is no change and 1% were not aware of the results.

Implications

- There is a need to build the capacities of group members in all roles of the safety audit process and not just observation, to make the process more participatory.
- There is a need to keep a regular track of the changes due to the audits, in the communities and regular follow-up with the service providers.

Challenges faced in the process of taking actions

Overall 60% shared that the major challenges they cited was the lack of information, 38% of the respondents cited the challenge of the limited reach to the government officials, 31% due to lack of confidence, 16% due to lack of time, 5% family pressure and 1% lack of education.

KIIs

Key findings

Asha workers (Bawana and Badarpur) cited the major challenges faced including- safety issues while visiting beneficiaries' homes and government hospitals, hesitancy and limited trust by the beneficiaries, often they have to bear the expenses of the beneficiaries while taking them to hospitals, lack of social security and low wages. The Asha worker from Bawana stated the most

important challenge she faced, *“Women are ready to undergo sterilization instead of their husbands because they feel that the operation might make their husbands weak and they would be unable to work for some time. Women are ready to go through the operation since they think it is okay for them to sit at home and rest.”*

Ration Shopkeepers (Bawana and Madanpur Khadar) cited that the only challenge they faced is regarding the quality of food grains. Often the community members blame them for the ration quality check, which is beyond their control. The ration shop keeper in Khadar laughed and said, *“Earlier I used to provide less quantities of food grains and nobody could know, but now the community members have become aware of the prices and hence there is no scope for any intended miscalculation”*.

Safai Karamcharis (Bawana and Badarpur) and Supervisor (Madanpur Khadar) discussed about major challenges faced by them including – poor cooperation from and poor civic sense of community members regarding cleanliness, inadequate number of workers/ staff in MCD leading to a delay in work, insufficient equipments for cleaning garbage and low wages and often delay in getting wages.

Police beat constable (Bawana), who was the only woman constable in Bawana, stated that she did not face any challenges as such. She shared that the attitude of the community women on situations of violence needs to be changed; domestic violence is a private matter and it is dealt with quite easily after counselling both the parties.

Implications

- Safety measures for Asha workers need to be considered.
- Appropriate awareness building programmes for all the stakeholders on their specific roles and responsibilities and related work processes are required.
- Sufficient monetary and logistical support for all these local service providers.
- Regular interactions with the community members to ensure transparency and trust building.

Next steps – suggestions by the respondents

The respondents were asked which mediums do they like Jagori to use in future. 74% of the respondents suggested that creative mediums of film screenings, theatre, radio etc. should be used rather than lectures and discussions. The respondents were asked the issues on which they need more information. 42% of the respondents expressed an interest on the issues of legal literacy followed by thematic understanding on issues and on government schemes, vocational and skill development courses.

Excerpts from the FGDs

“Safe access to adequate and well-maintained services is our right and service provision is the government’s responsibility, however, it is not enough, the patriarchal mind set and gender insensitive attitude of the stakeholders needs to be changed”

“If women and girls start coming out at night fearlessly, violence will be eliminated, they need to reclaim the streets and reclaim the nights”

“More and more women need to be visible in all positions of authority and responsibility, there should be women caretakers in the Community Toilet Complexes, women police constables, women SHOs, women MCD Superintendent, women Food and Supply officers, women MLAs, women councilors; they will surely bring some change”

“Legal literacy is important, we should know in details about laws, what works, what doesn’t and how can we make people accountable through the use of law”

“Group meetings are important but to address issues related to service provision, there is a greater need for meetings at the community level, where all stakeholders are present, face-to-face strategy really works!”

“The reality is men are scared now, they can’t see women who respond back, women who question, women who want to decide when, with whom they want to get married, this is also violence, men need to seriously think about themselves”

“100 Police Emergency helpline number is very commonly dialed, everyone remembers this, but the response system is weak, help lines will be beneficial only if the service providers take them seriously”

“What does the government think? Do people of resettlement colonies do not require Public transport? Majority of workers in the entire city comes from these low-income communities, if we go to work, then only the entire city is at work”

Some reflections by the team

- **Training component**

Capacity building trainings should focus on a greater use of information technology. Most of the respondents were aware and conducted safety audits using the Safetipin mobile app. A greater use is recommended to carry out frequent audits to monitor the changes. Basic primers in simple language should be prepared for ensuring a clear understanding on the issues. Structured modules should be developed to provide a thematic understanding on the issues.

- **Advocacy and alliance building**

There should be greater participation of the members as groups rather than individually in local advocacy initiatives. MLAs have a critical role to play since they are chairpersons and members of various vigilance committees – the Thana Level Committee, Ration Vigilance Committee, District Grievance Redress Committee and District Development committee. Efforts should be made to strengthen advocacy efforts for developing a relationship with MLAs. A greater collaboration is required with local NGOs. However, it should also be considered that community members today have certain perceptions on the

NGO work. Some responses from the FGDs revealed that on the one hand the participants stated that they have a strong trust in NGOs as they have contributed to their self/individual development and their community development; increasingly, many of them are pursuing Bachelors in Social Work and working as NGO workers, on the other hand, they believe that they can no longer trust the NGO work as the NGOs come, initiate projects and then vanish. They recommended that the future strategies should be to invest in developing strong community based organizations.