

# ***An Updated Strategic Framework for Women's Safety in Delhi 2015***

**28 April, 2015**



## **Table of Contents**

### **1. Introduction**

- 1.1 Growing Urbanisation
- 1.2 Ending Violence Against Women
- 1.3 International Initiatives
- 1.4 Gender and Urban Safety in Delhi

### **2. Strategies For Enhancing Women's Safety in Public Spaces**

- 2.2 Urban Planning and Design of Public Spaces
  - 2.2.1 Issues and Challenges
  - 2.2.2 Recent Initiatives
  - 2.2.3 Recommendations
- 2.3 Provision and Management of Urban Infrastructure and Services
  - 2.3.1 Issues and Challenges
  - 2.3.2 Recent Initiatives
  - 2.3.3 Recommendations
- 2.4 Public Transport
  - 2.4.1 Issues and Challenges
  - 2.4.2 Recent Initiatives
  - 2.4.3 Recommendations
- 2.5 Policing
  - 2.5.1 Issues and Challenge
  - 2.5.2 Recent Initiatives
  - 2.5.3 Recommendations
- 2.6 Legislation, Justice and Support to Victims
  - 2.6.1 Issues and Challenges
  - 2.6.2 Recent Initiatives
  - 2.6.3 Recommendations
- 2.7 Education
  - 2.7.1 Issues and Challenges
  - 2.7.2 Recent Initiatives
  - 2.7.3 Recommendations
- 2.8 Information Technology
  - 2.8.1 Issues and Challenges
  - 2.8.2 Recent Initiatives
  - 2.8.3 Recommendations

### **3.0 Summary and Conclusion**

## Foreword

Following up on 2010's *Draft Strategic Framework for Women's Safety in Delhi* (Jagori, UN Women, UN Habitat Department of Women and Child Development), this document seeks to analyze, on a sector-by-sector basis, respective issues and challenges, to catalog recent initiatives and programs which address the safety of women and girls in public spaces, and to provide recommendations for moving forward.

The knowledge presented in this document is the culmination of dialogue and research conducted not only within Jagori itself, but also with numerous partner organizations, researchers, activists, public officials, and other key stakeholders in Delhi. More specifically, many of the recommendations are drawn from the December 16, 2014 *"Take Back the Night Campaign,"* which brought together representatives from Safetipin, CFAR, Lawyers Collective, NFIW, AIPWA, Action India, Reclaim the Night, CHSJ, SNS, Samarthyam, Nirantar, Breakthrough, Women's Feature Service, Sakha Cabs, Azad Foundation, Miranda House and Kamla Nehru College.

It is intended that this document will help inform representatives civil society, public officials and all other individuals who are working towards making Delhi a safer city for all of its residents- a city where women and girls are free from both violence, as well as the fear of violence.

## **1. Introduction**

### *1.1 Growing Urbanisation*

The issue of growing urbanisation has taken centre stage today and the world is becoming more urban by the day. Today, 54 per cent of the world's population lives in urban areas, and that is expected to increase to 66 per cent by 2050. The 2014 revision of the World Urbanization Prospects by UN DESA's Population Division notes that the largest urban growth will take place in India, China and Nigeria. These three countries will account for 37 per cent of the projected growth of the world's urban population between 2014 and 2050. By 2050, India is projected to add 404 million urban dwellers, China 292 million and Nigeria 212 million.

The urban population growth, in absolute numbers, is concentrated in the less developed regions of the world. It is estimated that by 2017, even in less developed countries, a majority of people will be living in urban areas. One result of this is that these countries will face numerous challenges in meeting the needs of their growing urban populations, including for housing, infrastructure, transportation, energy and employment, as well as for basic services such as education and health care. In India providing basic services of these and water and sanitation are proving to be major challenges.

Managing urban growth has become a big agenda for countries and even the Post 2015 Sustainable goals have listed one goal as sustainable urbanisation. The proposed Goal number 11 is to "Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable". It is important to note that safety and inclusion have been used as it is now recognised that urban growth leads to insecurity and exclusion of the more vulnerable and marginalised populations.

Urbanization is an unprecedented challenge. By the middle of the century the great majority of slum dwellers in 2030 will be Asian or African. Urbanization and development are inextricably linked and it is necessary to a way of ensuring the sustainability of growth. Urbanization had become a driving force as well as a source of development with the power to change and improve lives.

The upcoming Habitat III Conference in October 2016 has the convening power to bring together all actors to achieve these objectives. Solutions for the complex challenge of urbanization can only be found by bringing together Member States, multilateral organizations, local governments, private sector and civil society. By embracing urbanization at all levels of human settlements, more appropriate policies can embrace urbanization across physical space, bridging urban, peri-urban and rural areas, and assist governments in addressing challenges through national and local development policy frameworks.

### *1.2 Ending Violence Against Women*

Violence against women is a human rights violation and a major obstacle to achieving equality in countries across the world. Violence against women in the home, at the workplace and in public places are a continuum and the women's movement the world over has played a significant role in highlighting these. The Safe cities for women movement is located within this larger movement for women's rights and equality. Over the past twenty years this safer cities movement has gained momentum and many cities now are beginning to view this as an important agenda.

The Take Back the Night marches in North America in the 1970's were one of the early campaigns to demand the right for safety in public places. In the later 1980's some cities in Canada and other developed countries set up Safer City divisions in local government to address issues of public and street safety of citizens. This has over the past twenty years spread to many more countries around the world. Women's groups advocated for women's right to move freely without fear of violence and for safer spaces.

"The growing safe cities for women movement aims to eliminate all forms of violence against women and girls by simultaneously targeting the systemic social factors that create gender inequality and empowering women and girls to make changes within their communities, At the core of the safe cities for women movement is the belief that violence and fear of violence restricts women's and girls' access to their cities including to employment, health, education, political and recreation facilities. Thus , as a result of violence and fear of violence, women and girls are excluded from various aspects of city life and do not have the same rights to cities as men" (WICI, Learning from Women to Create Gender Inclusive Cities")

**A Safe City for Women and Girls is:**

- A city where women and girls can enjoy public spaces and public life without fear of being assaulted.
- A city where violence is not exercised against women and girls in either the home or the street.
- A city where women and girls are not discriminated against and where their economic, social, political, and cultural rights are guaranteed.
- A city where women and girls participate in making decisions that affect the community in which they live.
- A city where the state guarantees the human rights of all people without excluding women and girls.
- A city where the state and local government take actions to provide attention, prevention, and punishment for violence against women and girls.
- A city where the state and local government guarantee women's and girls' access to justice.

[Source: UN Women, Safe Cities Module] <http://www.endvawnow.org/uploads/modules/pdf/1304107021.pdf>

### *1.3 International Initiatives*

There have been several global initiatives to address the issue of women's safety in cities. UN-HABITAT's Safer Cities programme has focused its attention on integrating gender perspectives into safety discussions; developing conceptual and practical tools and methodologies to combat violence against women; collecting, analyzing and disseminating gender-disaggregated data; and promoting the full and equal participation of women in human settlements planning and decision-making. The Safer Cities programme recommends a systematic approach to improving urban safety and countering gender-based violence, including:

1. Diagnosis of local insecurity;
2. Formation of a local coalition of stakeholders;
3. Strategy formulation and development of local action plans through city consultations;
4. Strategy implementation through a broad-based participatory process;
5. Institutionalisation of the crime prevention approach within the society and government; and
6. Monitoring and evaluation.

Like the Safer Cities programme, the ICPC also prescribes a five-step approach to community safety at the local government level, which involves:

1. Identification and mobilisation of key partners led by local city authorities;
2. A rigorous assessment or security diagnosis of local problems of urban safety;
3. Development of local action plans which address the root causes of crime;
4. Implementation and evaluation of long- and short-term projects which target social exclusion and urban poverty, specific crimes and specific geographical areas; and
5. Establishment of a central coordinating committee involving all relevant stakeholders.

Developed jointly by the ICPC and Safer Cities, this approach emphasises that building community safety is a long-term process, and that prevention must become a normal part of local governance (Institute for the Prevention of Crime 2008). This is reinforced by the UN Guidelines on Crime Prevention, which recommend that crime prevention should be integrated into social and economic policies and programs, including employment, education, health, housing and urban planning, poverty, social marginalisation and exclusion, so that the root causes can be addressed. These Guidelines also suggest that effective crime prevention can only be achieved through multi-stakeholder partnerships.

In Kenya, under the Safer Nairobi project supported by UN-HABITAT, the Nairobi City Council has committed itself to allocate specific, earmarked budgets for enhancing women's safety, and also develop a 'one-stop' model centre for women. This centre would bring together integrated

police and prosecution services, accessible judicial services, affordable legal and counselling services, doctor and medical services including capacity to preserve evidence, linkages to the court with ability to obtain instantaneous prosecution orders amongst other services, under one roof. In neighbouring Tanzania, making cities safer for women and children is included in the National Strategy for Urban Crime Prevention, also developed with the support of UN-HABITAT. The use of safety audits to pinpoint specific concerns is also highlighted.

UN Women has been an important actor in the Safe Cities Movement. In 2007 they launched the programme “Cities with no violence towards women” which was a regional initiative implemented by the Latin American Network Woman and Shelter in five cities across the region - Santiago, Chile; Rosario, Argentina; Bogota, Colombia; Guatemala city, Guatemala; and El Salvador city, El Salvador. This programme aimed to build awareness and knowledge, advocate for women’s empowerment, and eventually influence a range of public policies which have a bearing on women’s safety and gender violence in cities. In Bogota, four areas which house 40% of the city’s population were selected for pilot interventions, which include education and sensitisation for cultural transformation; land use planning and design with a gender perspective; building alliances and strategies; gender mainstreaming in the measurement and interpretation of statistics on violence against women; and, modernisation and professionalization of the armed forces and the courts from a gender perspective. There are also other initiatives in Latin America. In Mexico City, the public transportation system was looked at.

More recently they launched the UN Women’s Safe Cities Global Initiative includes two main flagship programmes. In 2010, with UN-Habitat and 50 other global and local partners, they launched “Safe Cities Free of Violence against Women and Girls” in Quito, Ecuador; Cairo, Egypt; New Delhi, India; Port Moresby, Papua New Guinea; and Kigali, Rwanda. It is the first-ever global comparative programme that develops, implements, and evaluates tools, policies and comprehensive approaches on the prevention of, and response to, sexual harassment and other forms of sexual violence against women and girls across different settings.

In 2011, UN Women, UNICEF, and UN-Habitat launched the “Safe and Sustainable Cities for All” joint programme in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil; San José, Costa Rica; Tegucigalpa, Honduras; Nairobi, Kenya; Beirut, Lebanon; Marrakesh, Morocco; Manila, Philippines; and Dushanbe, Tajikistan.

UN Women’s Safe Cities Global Initiative has generated a number of innovative results through partnerships with mayors’ offices, national Governments, women’s groups and other community partners. The municipality of Quito, for example, has amended a local ordinance to strengthen action against sexual harassment in public spaces. New Delhi has integrated Safe Cities approaches in social protection schemes, while Egypt’s Ministry of Housing, Utilities and Urban Development adopted women’s safety audits to guide urban planning. Port Moresby’s National Capital District has taken steps to improve women’s safety in local markets.

Another recent initiative at the international level was the “Gender Inclusive Cities Programme”, coordinated by Women in Cities International and supported by the UN Trust Fund to End Vio-

lence against Women. It sought to increase women's safety by identifying and disseminating effective and promising approaches that promote women's equal access to public space. The project was carried out in four cities around the world - Dar es Salaam in Tanzania, Delhi in India, Rosario in Argentina, and Petrozavodsk in Russia. In each city, research was done to establish the dimensions of the problem and identify the key stakeholders. This was followed by a set of projects which varied from working with the transport department in Delhi and Petrozavodsk, installing street signage and community policing in Dar es Salaam and working with community women to raise demands with political actors in Rosario. As a result of their actions within the programme, women have engaged with different sets of stakeholders including governments, nonprofit organisations, citizen groups, and the community in general, in order to design and implement strategies that can bring about significant measurable change in women's safety and right to the city. The engagement with local authorities is especially critical for bringing about a change in policies, and ensuring their implementation.

**The Delhi Declaration on Women's Safety (2010) states:**

"Violence against women and girls constitutes a human rights violation and continues to be an obstacle to reaching gender equality and equity, peace, and sustainable development;

Women's diverse experiences of city life are affected by gender based discrimination and abuse in public and private spaces, including exclusion from political and socio-economic participation, as well as limited access to essential services and infrastructure.

Women's and girls' right to the city includes the right to live free from violence and fear, in more equitable, democratic, and inclusive cities. Women and girls have the right to participate and be part of decision-making processes in local governance, urban planning, and management."

The Delhi Declaration was drafted by the delegates of the Third International Conference on Women's Safety, 2010. It follows the Montréal Declaration on Women's Safety (First International Seminar on Women's Safety, 2002) and the Declaration of Bogotá Safe Cities for Women and Girls (Second International Conference on Safer Cities for Women and Girls, 2004).]

[Source : Delhi Declaration on Women's Safety 2010. Available online at [http : //www.womenincities.org/pdf-general/delhi\\_declaration\\_call\\_to\\_action\\_web.pdf](http://www.womenincities.org/pdf-general/delhi_declaration_call_to_action_web.pdf)]

#### *1.4 Gender and Urban Safety in Delhi*

Women's safety has always been an issue in Delhi. For many years now, Delhi has reported higher rates of crimes against women than many other cities. This has further increased in the past two years with the increased spurt in reporting of crime. In 2011, the NCRB reported that there were 33,789 cases of crimes against women reported from 53 mega cities out of the total 2,28,650 cases reported in the country during 2011. Among them, Delhi accounted for 13.3% (4,489), followed by Bengaluru 5.6% (1,890), and Hyderabad 5.5% (1,860). The proportion of



IPC crimes committed against women increased during from 8.8 % in the year 2007 to 9.4% during the year 2011.

Since the December 2012 gang rape, Delhi has not been the same. Thousands of people of all ages and genders poured out into the city streets to protest the rape and murder of a young woman. The anger of the people which was initially ignored by the government eventually led to the setting up of the Justice Verma Commission which looked at all laws and policies that affected women's rights and well being in the country. The report of the Commission made many suggestions to improve laws and policies to make the country more women friendly. Some of the key changes are discussed in the appropriate sections in the report.

In 2013 there was a 26% increase in reporting of overall crimes against women and a 35% increase in rape reporting with Delhi reporting the highest number of rapes amongst all cities. The Delhi Police has announced that all crimes against women that are brought to the police station will be recorded and this has also contributed to the increase in reporting. There have been several responses from other government departments also which are discussed in the relevant sections.

## **2. Strategies for Enhancing Women's Safety in Public Spaces in Delhi**

### **2.2 Urban planning and design of public spaces.**

#### *2.2.1 Issues and Challenges*

The safety of women and girls is greatly impacted by the initial planning and design of public spaces in the cities where they study, work and live. All aspects which affect the design of a public space- from urban planning standards to bylaws - are important factors for ensuring that spaces are safe and equally accessible for women and girls. Additionally, the design of public spaces greatly impacts women's perceptions of safety, and can serve to induce or reduce any associated fear with traveling in and utilizing public spaces, thus improving their mobility. For instance, adequate lighting and the presence of street hawkers and other commercial establishments on streets are likely to increase feelings of safety.

Within the specific context of Delhi, urban planning is managed by the Delhi Development Authority (DDA), a para-statal body which ultimately reports to the Lieutenant Governor of Delhi. Similarly, the Municipal Corporation of Delhi (MCD) and associated bodies plan implementation (including that of bylaws and zoning regulations), and manages the construction of roads and a number of public places. Hence, it is important that actors in these agencies possess a firm understanding of how to design and manage public spaces in a manner that takes into account the safety of women and girls.

#### *2.2.2 Recent Initiatives*

India's **Twelfth Five-Year Plan** provides focus in a number of sectors on improving women's safety, mobility and access to public services. The document indicates that "...*Besides, cities should be able to provide basic services to migrant workers, their families and other vulnerable sections of society including women and children.*" The benefits of gender responsive infrastructure are acknowledged, and specific recommendations are made for addressing issues in

WASH and other sectors. With regard to the mobility of women, the document recommends that every city and town should produce a Development Plan (DP) which presents a perspective of 10 years or more. The DP must include a “...*City mobility plan with special emphasis of making cities safe for vulnerable groups including women and children, pedestrian and cyclists.*”

The **Institute for Human Development, Delhi** prepared a document titled “**Safety in Delhi**” in 2013, which as an input to the city’s Human Development Report, outlined Delhi’s context, state of crime, public perceptions and provided policy recommendations based on an analysis of key issues pertaining to violence against women and girls, as well as amongst other marginalized communities, in areas including urban planning and public transportation.

In 2012, UTTIPEC (United Traffic and Transportation Infrastructure [Planning and Engineering] Centre), a multi stakeholder urban body, conducted a **study in four vulnerable spots in Delhi**, in order to better understand gaps in urban planning from a women’s safety perspective. As a result, UTTIPEC was to prepare a pilot plan for a micro-level project involving other city planning and engineering agencies in order to suggest ways to improve safety in these four areas. Study findings with gender sensitive recommendations were also presented to Delhi government.

### *2.2.3 Recommendations*

#### Urban Planning:

- Develop improved database: Consolidation and comparison of existing data on safe and unsafe areas for women. More safety audits to identify areas/ neighbourhoods across Delhi which are most unsafe for women, and determine appropriate planning/design interventions in these.
- Increase “eyes on the street”: Ensure mixed land use in all new developments; promote and regulate informal sector activities (hawking/street vending, as has been done in Durban, for instance); change bylaws to ensure removal of setbacks and boundary walls; transparent glass facades for major commercial establishments; making parks and public squares more accessible, visible from the street, better landscaped, and well-lit. Focus implementation activities on priority areas identified through safety audits and street surveys.
- Promote gender diversity in public places: Safety audits have revealed gender diversity as being the most important factor for making women feel safe in public spaces. In addition to promoting the employment of female shop keepers, hawkers and vendors, there should also be more ways by which women are consciously encouraged to use public places such as having more women drivers, conductors, police, vendors, shop keepers and others on the streets.

#### Institutional Accountability:

- Ensure compliance: Provide detailed checklist on women’s safety provided to all developers, public and private. Compliance and certification to be made mandatory.

- Conduct training/capacity-building: Training of all DDA/municipal staff involved in planning, through lectures, city walks/ safety audits, and FGDs.
- Regularly collect data on women's safety: Make safety audits a regular planning tool and an integral part of the master planning process, with a commitment from local authorities to implement their recommendations.
- Update planning education: Modification of curricula for urban planning and urban design programmes to ensure women's safety issues are part of the training imparted to urban planners and designers. Similar inputs also provided to local government training institutions.

## 2.3 Provision and Management of Urban Infrastructure and Services

### 2.3.1 Issues and Challenges

As indicated in the previous section, the design of public spaces is an extremely important factor for reducing potential instances of violence and harassment, as well as any associated fear, discomfort, and restrictions on mobility. Yet it is not merely enough to design such spaces in a gender sensitive fashion; they must also be maintained. It has been observed that poorly maintained public infrastructure and services- including pavements, street lights, parks and other public spaces - are repeatedly reported as factors which contribute to making Delhi a city which is unsafe for women. Special attention is needed for female public toilets, which are often dirty and poorly lit, and for pavements- which are often broken and obstructed, preventing safe passage, especially in unsafe situations.

Within Delhi, the provision and management of urban infrastructure and services is a function of the Municipal Corporation of Delhi (MCD) and the state Public Works Department (PWD). A number of challenges exist within these bodies, including outdated standards, designs and materials, as well as a lack of transparency. Although the city saw major advances in street infrastructure prior to the Commonwealth Games in 2010, maintenance of such infrastructure has proven to be a perpetual challenge.

### 2.3.2 Recent Initiatives

In 2012, as part of the Safe Delhi Campaign, Jagori undertook a study, "**Mapping Women's Safety & Access to the City - A Study of Gender Gap Analysis of Five Municipal Wards of South Delhi.**" The resulting report identified gender gaps in essential services and issues related to women's safety, and was meant to enhance understandings of concerns related to safety in public spaces in 5 municipal wards which fall under the jurisdiction of the South Delhi Municipal Corporation (SDMC).

With regard to the WASH sector, in 2011, a number of organizations, including Jagori and its community partners in Bhalswa and Bawana communities in Delhi, WICI, IDRC, along with Action India and CBGA, conducted an **Action Research Project on Women's Rights and Access to Water And Sanitation in Asian Cities**. The research sought to ensure the participation of service providers, government officials, and a cross-section of community members along-

side women. The process employed women-centric participatory tools, and revealed significant findings and recommendations to be pursued by various stakeholders.

The Aam Aadmi party also indicates that over 300 night shelters for the homeless have been established.

### *2.3.3 Recommendations*

#### Infrastructural Improvements:

- **Maintain Lighting:** Measures must be taken to ensure that streets lights are installed with their light falling on the footpath. High mast lights should be installed especially at critical junctures in public places. Further the system of fixing lights that stop working should be made more responsive and efficient.
- **Maintain other key Infrastructure:** Similarly other infrastructure such as pavements should also be well maintained; trees should be regularly trimmed so that they do not block the lighting onto the pavement. Ramps and hand rails are not always unusable and need constant checks for usability and access for the disabled. There is need to ensure there is no obstruction on tactile pavements for access and movement for the visually challenged.
- **Provide safe and clean public toilets:** that the public toilets are not just available but are regularly maintained and monitored is essential. It is also important that security measures need to be checked outside the public toilets. Display of duty in-charge should be made mandatory along with the timings of the same. Some of the public toilets should provide around the clock service also.
- **Improve night shelters:** Night shelters are an important public service provided by the state for the homeless. Safety of homeless women is an issue in Delhi, both within and outside the night shelters. Standards to improve night shelters from a safety standpoint.

#### Institutional Accountability:

- **Conduct safety audits in all parts of the city:** Specific recommendations on design and maintenance of public spaces, infrastructure and services could be developed, and municipal staff, who could also be trained to undertake such audits at regular intervals. Safety audits to identify areas/ neighbourhoods which have poor quality or badly located public toilets, broken pavements, open garbage dumps, unlit car parks, and non-functional street lights.
- **Conduct safety audits in resettlement colonies as part of service provision activities:** Resettlement colonies on the periphery of the city are an important setting where women and girls are particularly vulnerable. Safety audits and FGDs on safety issues should be held in conjunction with consultations on service provision.

## 2.4 Public Transport

### 2.4.1 Issues and Challenges

Public transportation must be planned and designed from a gendered perspective, as it is repeatedly demonstrated that public transportation is used differently by men and women. There exists variation in terms of the modes of transportation used by men and women, as well as the reasons, times and ways for their use. For instance, in India, even in car-owning households, men typically drive, whereas women typically make use of public transportation. Previous research conducted by Jagori builds a strong body of evidence to indicate that public transportation in Delhi- including buses, metros, auto-rickshaws, taxis- along with their respective stops and waiting areas, are unsafe for women. In spite of such a lack of safety, it is continually necessary that women access such services.

Public transportation facilities in Delhi are managed by the Delhi Transport Corporation (DTC), except for the Delhi Metro, which is an independently run body which is accountable directly to the Chief Minister. For public service vehicles, licensing is provided through the transport department of the Government of Delhi. Additionally, a number of private carriers, including taxis which are hired by business process outsourcing (BPO) operators, are officially registered in the nearby city of Guragon, Haryana, and as such they are regulated outside the purview of Delhi authorities.

### 2.4.2 Recent Initiatives

Within the context of Delhi, a number of **new regulations pertaining to public transportation** have been developed in recent years. A number of regulations are aimed at improving women's safety. For instance, as of March 1, 2013, the Transport Department amended permit conditions for buses (DTC, DIMTS, privately-operated buses), to reserve 25% of their capacity for women. It has also become mandatory for credentials (names, contact details and photographs) of drivers and staff on vehicles to be displayed, and PSV badge numbers, as provided by the Transport Department, must be placed on the display chart.

In response to the Uber rape case, the Home Ministry has also mandated the **installation of GPS systems** in all public utility vehicles. This will include Delhi Transport Corporation (DTC) and cluster busses. Previously, in 2013, Delhi Government had also announced that **panic buttons** were to be activated on all DTC buses. On low-floor buses, such panic buttons were already in existence prior to the December 16th gang-rape, although it is understood that these had been often times disconnected due to general misuse by passengers. The DTC has also begun efforts to install CCTV cameras on buses, and as of August 2014, 200 such cameras had been installed thus far.

In September 2012, the Delhi High Court gave the green signal for installation of Global Positioning System (GPS) and printers in auto-rickshaws for tracking their movement and providing

print-outs of fares for distances travelled to passengers to provide secure and transparent travel to them in the Capital.

Gender sensitisation training of transport staff has been carried out since 2007 when Jagori trained over 3500 drivers and conductors in a pilot project. This was subsequently followed up with incorporation of a module on gender sensitisation into the training curriculum of drivers and conductors of the DTC. More recently, another organisation, Manas has conducted a training of auto rickshaw drivers on issues of gender sensitisation and will also be training taxi drivers.

The DTC has also taken its first steps towards including female drivers in its ranks, and has recently hired a female bus driver, and the organization has indicated its willingness to hire additional female drivers in the future.

### *2.4.3 Recommendations*

#### Structural Improvements:

- Increase the number of hawking platforms: Hawkers and late night eating joints/café's to be permitted at major bus stops, metro stations, especially at transport interchanges.
- Explore gender sensitive options for improving last mile connectivity: Policies on allowing rickshaws and autos to congregate near metro stations must be reviewed and they could be made more systematic, user friendly and well monitored. Means for improving access to transportation in neighborhood and colonies should be explored. Additionally, adding pre-paid auto stands at high-use metro stations would help reduce discomforts associated with travel during the last mile. For the last mile connectivity, it is also crucial to note that while the metro has enabled women to independently traverse long distances at night, the last lap continues to be daunting. It is recommended to have a person employed and posted at the exit who allots slips and notes the numbers of cycle rickshaws and autos that women take pre 8am and post 8 pm when they exit from the metro.
- Maintain Information at Bus Stops: It should be mandatory for all bus stops to clearly display the name, bus routes number and emergency helpline numbers. Display of information is highly likely to be used at the time of emergencies in situations of emergency. Hence clearly visible, illuminated emergency contact information must be added at bus stops. Creating kiosks, preferably open round the clock would enhance activity around the bus stop therefore making it more comfortable to access.

#### Safety Mechanisms:

- Increase advertisement of helpline numbers: Clear written and audio announcement of helpline numbers. Electronic messaging on women's safety inside buses and at bus stops, as well as billboards outside buses. Brief advertisements on women's safety to be played on LCD screens which have been installed in some buses.
- Ensure visible police presence: Increased visible presence of marshals or police personnel at busy bus stops and metro stations, supplemented by plainclothes policemen

and women. PCR vans to be parked near busy public transit points, especially during rush hours, and at night.

- Institute random checks: should be conducted by mobile teams to ensure that various requirements including the display of auto and taxi drivers' identification, service standards and helpline numbers.
- Expand role of mobile teams: Expanding the mandate of the transport department's mobile teams to include response to safety issues and complaints.
- Enforce women-only metro compartments and buses: It has proved to be difficult to deter men from entering these compartments. These spaces can only be made sustainable through a combination of strict enforcement and civic education and awareness building. In addition, women-only bus services should also be introduced on major routes during rush hours.
- Provide emergency telephones at transit points: Installation of emergency telephones, linked to a central helpline, at major bus and metro stations, in subways and selected pedestrian crossings, perhaps with sponsorship from one of the major mobile companies in Delhi.
- Create integrated control room and helpline number for autos and taxis: Setting up a central toll-free helpline number and widely publicizing it, for both calling an auto/taxi as well as registering complaints.
- Scale-up advocacy efforts: Public awareness campaigns in the print and electronic media to raise awareness on women's safety, promote changes in attitude, encourage witnesses and citizens to intervene, and deter perpetrators.
- Implement a "between stops" program: After dark, a "between stops" programme could be introduced on public buses, where women passengers on their own can ask for the bus to be stopped closer to their home and not only at prescribed bus stops.
- Increase the number of women drivers: It is important to increase the number of women drivers working in public transportation. Therefore the state must expand investment in programmes that will train women drivers for public transport. This should include a number of steps: a) Making licensing processes gender sensitive; b) making a single window system available where women applicants could go for trouble shooting for getting licenses made; c) Hiring more women driving instructors; d) Ensuring women drivers to get jobs in public and government transport, e) Special subsidies and schemes need to be made available to women to encourage women drivers to buy their own cabs/vehicles and run it on a commercial basis; f) ensure access to safe and hygienic public washroom facilities for women drivers.

#### Institutional Accountability:

- Incorporate women's voices in the planning process: State agencies must institutionalize a consultative process for developing policies, monitoring and gender audits. Regular

consultations with groups of experts, with women's groups, targeted surveys of female passengers are to be undertaken.

- **Collect gender-disaggregated data to improve transportation services:** A comprehensive database including gender-disaggregated data on transportation patterns, taking into account the times and places at which women travel, among other tangible factors to be institutionalized by the State. This data would greatly assist both the state, as well as private agencies, in carefully determining the provision of special services for women, such as shuttles for university students and late night cabs for working women. Affordable and safe transit services should be equally made available to women who live on the fringes of the city and in far away community settlements.
- **Conduct training/capacity-building:** Sensitisation/training of public transport staff, including bus drivers and conductors, metro drivers and ticketing staff at metro stations, on the importance of ensuring women's safety, and actions to be taken when an incidence of sexual harassment is witnessed or reported. Training of auto-rickshaw and taxi drivers on women's safety issues has begun with some autos, and must be extended to all autos and taxis.
- **Enforce zero tolerance policy:** Zero tolerance policy towards sexual harassment of women by drivers and conductors of all public service vehicles, including buses, autos, taxis and other private hire vehicles registered in Delhi.

## **2.5 Policing**

### *2.5.1 Issues and Challenges*

According to the street survey conducted by Jagori in 2010, which sought to understand perceptions of safety in public spaces, it was revealed that the absence of any visible police presence was an important factor for making women feel unsafe. Yet, ironically, a body of research also reveals that women in India are unlikely to report incidents of sexual harassment to police authorities- on account of the fact that police often fail to respond appropriately or to trivialize such incidents. A number of challenges continue to impede upon improving police responses, and reform- a sensitive issue- requires a concerted effort to improve the actual staffed numbers of qualified personnel, as well as to improve upon various institutional and legal dimensions.

Police forces, both within Delhi and throughout the nation, have historically faced an overall dearth of female officers, particularly in high-ranking and decision-making positions. In response to this gap, a recent 2015 initiative has sought to mandate a 33% reservation for women at the constable to sub-inspector levels in the police forces in Delhi and in other union territories. A number of issues also exist with regard to the employment of female officers and other staff, for instance, in Delhi, there is a lack of any policy on women in the police force, and a lack of safe and decent working conditions for women personnel- promoting an environment in which sexual harassment is prevalent.

### *2.5.2 Recent Initiatives*



Security on public busses has also been greatly increased in response to the December 16th gang-rape. Approximately **120 home guards are providing security on night buses** from 21 bus depots. The uniformed officers work actively on DTC buses from 11:00PM to 7:00AM.

According to the Home Ministry, the body has recognized deficiencies in the women's helpline, and the helpline (No. 100) **now operates with an increased capacity of 100 lines**, up from a previous 60.

Since 2010, there have been a number of **advancements in the area of policing**. As of 2013, all 180 police stations in Delhi are supposed to have female officers present, staffing women's help desks, on a 24-7 basis, to specifically handle crimes against women. A minimum of 2 women sub-inspectors, and 7 women constables are to be deployed in each police station.

370 additional PCR vans were to be put into service by mid-2013, in order to "...make the rounds of ... women's schools/colleges and working women's hostels, besides public places frequented by women." The current number of PCR vans stands at 1,000 in Delhi. In addition to the increased deployment of PCR vans, motor cycles and pickets have been deployed to cover vulnerable locations, and a Special CP-level officer has been appointed in order to facilitate regular interaction with NGOs and civil society.

In the same year, Jagori, MARG and UN Women conducted a **study of Delhi Police Helplines** (100 and 1091) in order to understand the nature of police responses at the helpline level, and to build upon previous research in order to specifically understand women's experiences and responses which they receive from police helplines. The study also sought to discover how police helplines may be strengthened in order to facilitate further relief and support for those facing violence. Also related to these police helplines, Jagori conducted gender sensitization training to over 450 operators of 100, 1091 (and 1096) helpline numbers [year?]

The **usage of CCTVs** as a safety measure have also gained significant prominence in Delhi in recent years. For instance, the Delhi Police had indicated that 3,000 CCTV cameras will be installed across the city by March 2013, and the recently re-elected Aam Admi Party has indicated that it will install a network of such cameras across the city as a security measure. As indicated by the Home Ministry, as of December 2014, the government has installed 377 CCTV cameras in Delhi, with another 1500 coming soon.

The **Delhi police holds a regular monthly meetings with NGO's and CBO's** working in the city, in order to hear their grievances and concerns. These meetings were instituted in January 2013, and continue till date. It is considered a good platform to share problems related to working with the police at the community and grassroots level, and for finding solutions.

As crimes which are committed online have become more prevalent in recent years, the Delhi Police also maintains a **Cyber Crime Cell** to specifically address such incidents.

### *2.5.3 Recommendations*

Improvements for Public Safety:

- Ensure public police presence: Our audits and other studies done show that the presence of police in public spaces increases the confidence and feeling of safety of women

and others in cities. Security on the streets improves in large measure with a vibrant street life, this simply does not exist in New Delhi, much less in winter and this needs to be taken note of. Security measures need to be scaled up in winter, with more vigilant police on the beat.

- Enhance publicity of helplines: Increasing publicity of the 1091 number and email helpline will help make the Unit more accessible to women who have experienced sexual harassment in public spaces.
- Increase advocacy efforts: Conduct an advocacy campaign on women's safety, acceptable and unacceptable forms of behaviour, punishment for SH, and the importance of reporting incidents, through college and university helplines, especially during the admissions period.

#### **Institutional Accountability:**

- Develop new SOPs: Police services should implement gender-sensitive and appropriate standard operating procedures (SOPs) for handling all cases of violence against women. Currently, such standards are not in place.
- Conduct training/capacity-building: For all officers, inspectors and sub-inspectors, to begin with, in women's safety issues, including the importance of not trivializing the incident, recording the time and place of its occurrence, and providing a supportive response to the victim. Developing and widely publicising a zero tolerance policy towards sexual harassment in public spaces.
- Develop a comprehensive strategy towards inducting and retaining women in the police force: This could include, for instance, a review of benefits, preferential housing allocation for women personnel, improved working conditions (including basic amenities like toilets and clean work spaces which are often lacking), avenues for training, capacity-building and career progress, and a zero tolerance towards sexual harassment within the police force.

## **2.6 Legislation, Justice and Support to Victims**

### ***2.6.1 Issues and Challenges***

The legal and judicial space has been a significant area of focus in the recent years following the December 16th gang-rape in Delhi. The incident eventually led to the Justice Verma Committee Report, which outlined a number of across-the-board recommendations for legal and policy reform to address sexual violence and harassment. Although the Criminal Law (Amendment) Act, as discussed below, made a number of important revisions to the Indian Penal Code (IPC), including provisions regarding sexual harassment (354A), voyeurism (354C) and stalking (354D), there are an additional number of challenges which limit access to justice for survivors who experience harassment and violence in public spaces.

Violence which occurs in public spaces has its own particularities which makes prosecuting for crimes increasingly difficult: the perpetrator(s) are usually mobile- whether on foot, public transportation or in their own vehicle- making them difficult to apprehend, and even when raising an alarm, there is often reluctance on behalf of bystanders to become involved in such incidents.

In addition to the long standing social stigmatization that surrounds survivors who report their experiences, there is a lack of seriousness for addressing such incidents amongst police departments and other bodies. Police are known to avoid registering incidents which are seen as “minor crimes”- including sexual harassment in the form of visual, verbal or physical harassment. As such, underreporting is rampant, though it has increased in the past two years. In general, survivors of crimes which occur in public spaces tend to not have access to legal, financial, social, emotional and/or psychological support.

### *2.6.2 Recent Initiatives*

Following upon the recommendations as provided by the Justice Verma Committee, the **Criminal Law (Amendment) Act** was ratified in 2013. While the act provides key new revisions to Indian law with regard to violence against women, including the criminalization of acid attacks, and modifications to existing laws on voyeurism, stalking and trafficking, most of the recommendations provided in the report have remained unimplemented till date. Amongst other shortcomings, the act failed to criminalize marital rape and served to lower the age of consent. Specifically with regard to acid attacks, the 2014 **Acid (Control) Bill** seeks to further restrict the sale of acids and to provide punishments for perpetrators.

In 2013, the **Sexual Harassment of Women at Workplace (Prohibition, Prevention and Redressal) Act** was also enacted. The act is particularly notable in the sense that it defines sexual harassment as a multi-faceted phenomenon, encompassing unwanted physical, verbal and non-verbal conduct of a sexual nature. The act also mandates that employers establish internal complaints committees, to address issues of sexual harassment in the workplace.

Although currently a bill, the **Indecent Representation of Women (Prohibition) Amendment Bill (2012)**, aims to update the original 1986 act to provide more stricter punishments against those convicted of the indecent representation of women. The bill has also proposes to amend the initial legislation to encompass new forms of communication, including the internet, cable television and others.

The **Street Vendors (Protection of Livelihood and Regulation of Street Vending) Act, 2012**, is a particularly new and potentially promising piece of legislation, as it seeks to regulate street vending activities and it enables local authorities to demarcate vending zones, and to enforce conditions for and restrictions with regard to street vending. Unfortunately, the act fails to mandate that a consultative process be used to formulate street vending plans, nor does it mandate standard a set of standard norms or regulations to be used by local governments in issuing vending certificates and for the establishment of vending zones.

Another significant bill which is pending in the Lok Sabha is the **Right of Persons with Disabilities Bill (2014)**, which seeks to legally define disability and the rights of persons with disabilities. Particularly relevant to the issue of developing cities which are safe for all residents, the act mandates that all existing public buildings are to be made accessible within a five year period following the development of regulations by the National Commission for Persons with Disabili-

ties. Furthermore, all new structures, completion certificates and permissions to occupy buildings will not be provided to any establishment unless the structure meets the provided requirements.

In light of the December 16th gang-rape in Delhi, there has also been significant discussion of the creation of a so-called “**Good Samaritan**” law, in order to encourage bystanders to assist victims of roadside accidents. Bystanders are often times reluctant to intervene in such situations, out of fear of possible questioning or harassment from police, or for assuming any liability or responsibility for crimes or incidents. Till date, while such legislation has been proposed, it has yet to pass

According to the Government of Delhi, all government, as well as private hospitals in the national capital region (NCR) are to provide “**immediate and free**” **medical treatment** to victims of acid attack or rape.

Also in Delhi, following the December 16th gang-rape, the government launched the **181 women’s distress helpline**, which should be further scaled up.

The 2014 budget for Delhi includes the provision of **one-stop crisis centers** for rape survivors, which will provide medical examination, counseling, as well as police and legal assistance. Per the budget, such centers are supposed to be established in one government hospital in each district of the city. The first of such centers was established at the Sanjay Gandhi Memorial hospital in August 2014.

### *2.6.3 Recommendations*

- Amend the IPC, CrPC and the Evidence Act to make sexual harassment a non-bailable offence: In spite of the amendments introduced by Criminal Law Amendment Act (2013), sexual harassment remains a bailable offense. States such as Andhra Pradesh, Tamil Nadu and Orissa have shown the way in this regard - sexual harassment (“eve-teasing/ outraging the modesty of a woman”) is a non-bailable offense with strict punishments.
- Improve access to information: A directory of NGOs working to support women who are victims of sexual harassment can be compiled and disseminated widely through GRCs, local schools and colleges, RWAs and MTAs. Additionally there should be a mapping of support services for Violence Against Women (VAW), and such information should be easily and readily available.
- Expand access to support services through the GRCs: The mandate of Gender Resource Centres could be expanded to include recording of cases of sexual harassment in public spaces, maintenance of records and liaison with the police, and providing information and support to victims. The GRCs are already responsible for socio-economic empowerment of women and girls, including providing them with skill development, vocational training, functional literacy, leadership and confidence training, legal support, as well as self-defence training. They could be provided with information materials and guidelines (including Jagori’s sexual harassment booklets and posters) to educate women and girls on gender issues and the problem of sexual harassment in particular, encourage them to report incidents of SH, provide

counselling services, and advise them on the legal recourse and other mechanisms of redressal available.

## 2.7 Education

### 2.7.1 Issues and Challenges

The educational space continues to be a critical venue for addressing women's safety, in a variety of ways. First and foremost, falling within the conversation on addressing violence against women and girls in public spaces, it is a constant challenge to ensure safe spaces for women and girls within and around schools, colleges and university campuses, where girls and women gather en masse, and are frequent targets of harassment. Additionally, as widely recognized, educational institutions have the potential to serve as venues for educating all citizens about the unacceptability of sexual harassment and assault, to raise awareness about laws governing such crimes, and for connecting individuals to key resources for seeking help in responding to such incidents- including legal information, counseling, helplines and other resources. Unfortunately, such important programming is often not mandated.

With regard to addressing the safety of women and girls in public spaces surrounding educational institutions- while more tangibly, infrastructure must be maintained and/or upgraded (such as ensuring proper lighting and access to clean and safe washrooms), mechanisms and support services for addressing incidents must also be provided to students. While some resistance may be faced in accomplishing such objectives, even greater challenges may lie in the area of integrating key education about sexual harassment and assault into educational curricula.

### 2.7.2 Recent Initiatives

The Government of the NCT of Delhi, held a **multi-stakeholder meeting** in January 2013, in order to review existing gaps in the school system from a gender lens, and to advocate for the integration of gender sensitive teaching curriculums and practices. The Department of Education/SCERT, along with Jagori, Pravah and Plan India presented a number of key points, including the need to review NCERT and SCERT textbooks, to review gaps in classroom teaching from a gender perspective, and learning strategies were exchanged. A curriculum review committee, under the leadership of the Ministry of Education and coordinated by SCERT, held six round table discussions to share concerns on including gender perspectives into teacher training and student curriculums. Jagori, Pravah and Plan India shared a module on gender discrimination and safety that could be included in the training pedagogy for teachers and students of classes 6-9.

With approval from the Directorate of Education, Jagori and Pravah conducted a '**safe school intervention**' with teachers, students and the student management councils of eight government schools from the south district [of what city?]. Additionally, a safe school campaign and audits were held in eight south district secondary government schools.

Delhi University provided a **booklet containing information on university policies and key contact information** (including police and hospitals) for students to ensure their safety.

### 2.7.3 Recommendations

### Institutional Accountability:

- Conduct brainstorming sessions with school teachers, principals, parents: Sessions should consider how to make the environment within and around the school safer for girls and women (e.g. through better infrastructure such toilets, well-lit corridors, improved lighting around the institution and on connecting streets, appointment and accessibility of counsellors, laying down strict guidelines relating to treatment of girl students, etc.)
- Prepare and circulate simple guidelines to all educational institutions: Such guidelines will outline how to improve the institutions' physical environment and amenities, in order to make the spaces within and around them safe for girls and women.
- Conduct safety audits of all schools, colleges and university campus areas: Audits will identify the specific challenges relating to safety of girls and women. This could be made mandatory for every educational institution, to be conducted by staff and students of the institution itself.–
- Ensure that school and campus facilities, including hostels and PG accommodation, are safe for female students: Conduct certification of secure non-campus accommodation by the police and students' associations, based on predetermined criteria, in order to prevent sexual and other forms of harassment by landlords.
- Hold sensitisation workshops for all principals and teachers, both male and female: Workshops on issues of women's safety and sexual harassment advocacy campaign on diversity, especially at college and university level, should be held, in order to discourage harassment of girls and women students belonging to any particular religion, community or state.
- Review school and college curriculums: A review should be conducted in order to see where gender equality/violence against women/women's safety issues can be incorporated. Training of teachers encourage dialogue and discussion on sensitive issues

### Advocacy:

- Coordinate campaigns, street plays, DVDs and other creative messaging: Such advocacy may be conducted in and around schools and colleges to promote the importance of women's safety in public spaces, and the unacceptability of sexual harassment in any form.

## **2.8 Information Technology**

### *2.8.1 Issues and Challenges*

In the recent years, we have seen the rise of several different technology and technology tools being developed to address the issue of women's safety. Both online mediums and mobile platforms have been used. In a world where technology is ubiquitous, it is inevitable that we will also search for technological solutions to social problems. It is also the increase in awareness that has led more individuals and companies to begin to search for solutions. Following the December 16th case, many emergency apps were developed that were envisaged as tools that women could have in their hands in case they in a situation where they faced danger. Some

other technologies have been conceived of as data collection instruments to point out areas that are less and more safe for women.

Crowdsourcing has also been an important element where some of the technologies are attempting to build up a data base of information through encouraging direct feedback from the public. In a world where online activism has started playing an important role, many of these technologies provide a platform for people to engage in a meaningful way.

Of course there are also limitations and challenges to online and mobile technologies. The key challenge is to find ways of ensuring that it can reach the more vulnerable populations and especially be beneficial to those who do not necessarily have access to the technologies.

Technology has also been used to inflict violence against women and these need to be understood better. Many young women have faced cyber stalking and other as a means to blackmail women who are vulnerable. There have also been cases of videos of rape and gang rape that have been circulating.

### *2.8.2 Recent Initiatives*

A number of civil society initiatives have also sought to make use of technology in addressing women's safety in public spaces within India. For instance, **Safetipin** released a mobile application in November 2003, which allows individual users to conduct 'safety audits' around their cities using their personal smartphones. As part of the safety audit process, the application asks users to report important information about lighting, the quality of streets and walkways, gender diversity, and other key factors which contribute to general feelings of safety in public spaces. Using the data gathered through this application, organizations can make recommendations to government bodies on how to upgrade and improve infrastructure in urban areas.

One notable instance of usage of the application was a city wide safety audits that was conducted in **December 16th, 2014 campaign** by women's organizations in Delhi, including Jagori, Lawyers Collective, Sakha, Azad Foundation and others. Using the application, participants conducted safety audits along 60km of roads in Delhi, on four designated routes, including those used by the perpetrators of the December 16th gang-rape, and more recent rape by an Uber taxi driver.

While a number of other mobile applications concerned with women's safety in public spaces exist, another example is "**VithU**" by Channel V. Developed in response to the December 16th gang-rape, this mobile phone application is activated by tapping twice on an icon, which instantly sends emergent messages to pre-designated emergency contacts. There are many similar applications, including Fight Back, B Safe, Raksha and Nirbhaya among others. The Delhi police also released an emergency app, Himmat, which allows women to send distress messages to the police if they feel they are in a situation of danger.

**Safetcity.in** is another initiative which is an online map to record incidents of harassment around the city. This was also set up in early 2013. They encourage women to report where they have faced violence and sexual harassment and pin it on a map in order to create awareness about safe and unsafe areas. These initiatives are also a way of breaking the silence around sexual violence by giving women an anonymous method of reporting harassment. This is useful

as it provides data on sexual harassment cases that may not necessarily reach the police and therefore a better understanding on victimisation.

### *2.8.3 Recommendations*

- Promote knowledge and access to the Cyber Crime Branch: Delhi Police's Cyber Crime Branch should develop a website and online resource center for city residents to learn more about various forms of cyber crime and to actively report such incidents.
- Increase training for police on cyber crimes: Hold training and awareness sessions for Delhi Police officials in order to orient them on various forms of cyber crimes and how to respond to such incidents.
- Conduct research and innovation to find technologies to address the safety concerns of the most vulnerable: While a number of mobile applications and other IT products have been developed in recent years, many of these solutions are available only to those who have access to (relatively recent models of) smartphones. Solutions should be designed in order to be accessible from more basic phone models.

## **3.0 Summary and Conclusion**

While the world follows a trend of ever-increasing urbanization, it must simultaneously follow a path towards ensuring that all citizens have equal access to safety and security within its cities. Despite the many challenges, several promising models for the development of safe cities, in which all residents are able to live free from violence and any associated fears of violence, have been demonstrated in the global context, particularly through programs presented by several multilateral bodies, including UN Women and UN Habitat. Within the more local context of Delhi, a sectoral examination of different areas which impact the safety of women and girls in public spaces reveals recent areas of progress, as well as long-standing challenges, and critical recommendations for moving forward.

As suggested, urban spaces must be initially designed and planned in a manner that promotes equal safety and accessibility for women and girls, and effective management of infrastructure and services is crucial for maintaining such safety. Gendered patterns of usage must be taken into account when designing and operating public transportation systems, and increased gender sensitivity and staffing of female officers in decision-making roles are also necessary. In the legal and judiciary space, barriers to accessing justice must be removed. Additionally, in the education sector, necessary steps must be taken to improve the safety of women and girls around educational institutions, and schools must serve as sites for both changing harmful norms, and for increasing access to support for survivors of violence. While information technology has incredible potential for addressing violence against women, careful consideration must also be taken with regard to ways in which technology is being used to commit harassment and violence.

In moving forward, for the citizens of Delhi, and of all other cities of the world- both those which are currently burgeoning metropolises, and those presently undergoing rapid expansion- must consciously decide whether their cities will be safe cities for all residents. While the recommendations put forward in this document are starting points for necessary and inevitable change,



collaboration amongst civil society, governments, communities and other stakeholders is necessary for their success.